**Revista Românească pentru Educație Multidimensională**
ISSN: 2066-7329 | e-ISSN: 2067-9270
Covered in: Web of Science (WOS); EBSCO; ERIH+; Google Scholar; Index Copernicus; Ideas RePeC; Econpapers; Socionet; CEEOL; Ulrich ProQuest; Cabell, Journalseek; Scipio; Philpapers; SHERPA/RoMEO repositories; KVK; WorldCat; CrossRef; CrossCheck

2022, Volume 14, Issue 1Sup1, pages: 419-436 | https://doi.org/10.18662/rrem/14.1Sup1/559
*Submitted:* August 10th 2021 | *Accepted for publication:* February 12th 2022

# Andragogy in Ukraine and Western Europe: Common and Different Features throughout Its History

**Liudmyla TYMCHUK[1], Mykhailo HONCHAR[2], Serhii MEDYNSKYI[3], Nadiia BILYK[4], Yana TOPOLNIK[5], Valentyna SERHEIEVA[6]**

[1] Yuriy Fedkovych Chernivtsi National University, Chernivtsi, Ukraine, l.tymchuk@chnu.edu.ua, http://orcid.org/0000-0002-3122-8150

[2] Communal Higher Educational Establishment "Kherson Academy of Continuing Education" of Kherson Regional Council, Kherson, Ukraine, m.honchar@gmail.com, http://orcid.org/0000-0002-1508-5276

[3] Bogdan Khmelnitsky Melitopol State Pedagogical University, Melitopol, Ukraine, sermedyn@ukr.net; ORCID http://orcid.org/0000-0001-6082-6566; Science Researcher ID R-9153-2016

[4] Poltava M. V. Ostrogradsky Regional Institute of In-Service Teacher Training, Poltava, Ukraine, bilyk@poippo.pl.ua, http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2344-5347

[5] State Higher Educational Institution "Donbas State Pedagogical University", Sloviansk, Ukraine, yannetkatop@gmail.com; http://orcid.org/0000-0001-7885-9454

[6] Lesya Ukrainka Volyn National University, Lutsk, Ukraine, valentina.sergeeva@live.com, ORCID ID https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0800-3401

**Abstract**: The article aims to study and summarize the historical experience of training adult education specialists in Ukraine and compare it with the politically unbiased experience of Western Europe. It analyzes the origins of adult education didactic and justifies the evolution of scientific-theoretical approaches to building the content, organizational forms and methods of adult learning. Besides, the article traces the stages and reasons behind socio-political and sociocultural changes in the content of education. It describes a stable development of organizational forms and methods of adult learning which adhere to the specifics of adult learners and boost their activity. The article proves that Soviet Ukrainian andragogy depended on state planning, ideology and favoured the public good over the personal good. Furthermore, the article substantiates evolutionary processes in the development of the professional training system for adults in Ukraine and Western Europe and identifies the coverage of the issue in question in the scientific literature. The findings of the comparative study suggest ways to improve the current system of adult education in Ukraine and develop andragogy as its scientific-theoretical and methodological basis.

**Keywords:** *andragogy, historical experience, continuing education, learning programmes, training adult teachers.*

**How to cite:** Tymchuk, L., Honchar, M., Medynskyi, S., Bilyk, N., Topolnik, Y., & Serheieva, V. (2022). Andragogy in Ukraine and Western Europe: Common and Different Features throughout Its History. *Revista Românească pentru Educație Multidimensională, 14*(1Sup1), 419-436. https://doi.org/10.18662/rrem/14.1Sup1/559

## 1. Introduction

New challenges require a necessary modernization of the educational system as a leading factor in the socio-cultural generation, successful human activity and its further improvement. Adult education is becoming more and more important. In international terminology, it is defined as an organic component of continuing education, which is designed to expand opportunities for lifelong learning of individuals and create conditions for their continuing development and mastery of knowledge and skills necessary for active creative life expressed in effective professional and social activities. At the same time, Ukraine, as a country with a short history of independence, has avoided the early global andrological context. The history of Ukrainian andrology covers positive stages, as well as times of "falling out" of this context.

In recent years, Ukrainian researchers have actively worked on the problems of adult learning: philosophical, theoretical and methodological principles of adult education in the system of continuing education (Arkhipova, 2002; Boltivets, 2010; Lukianova, 2012; Prots et al., 2021; Sihaieva, 2010; Ziaziun, 2001); andragogical principles of postgraduate professional education (Povidaichyk, 2021; Protasova & Putsov, 2002; Gurevych et al., 2020; Honcharuk et al., 2021; Zhurat et al., 2020); the features and technologies of adult learning (Arkhipova, 2002; Demchenko et al., 2021; Karasievych et al., 2021; Sarancha et al., 2021; Shahina, 2017); comparative andragogy and comparative studies (Desiatov, 2014; Khatsaiuk et al., 2021; Kosholap et al., 2021; Kovalenko, 2005; Ohiienko, 2009; Sahun, 2011; Shuhalii, 2015; Sukhomlynska, 2003; Ovcharuk et al., 2021).

An important aspect of the national knowledge about humanities is the comparative history of andragogy, which allows one to turn to valuable and time-tested initiatives in the field of adult learning. The issues of the history of adult education in Ukraine have been addressed by Vovk (1995), Vorobets (2001), Koliada (2004), Martirosian (2013), Sihaieva (2010). Some of its aspects have been covered in scientific publications by Hipters (2014), Lukianova (2012), Zavhorodnia (2014). However, there are almost no comparative studies on the typology and history of Ukrainian and Western European andragogy, which makes the topic of this article relevant. Indeed, its findings can deepen the international experience of andragogy by comparing it with the history of andragogy in Ukraine as the country that has been in scientific isolation for more than 70 years. Such studies allow one to outline the proven achievements and alternative concepts of world

andragogy. They also may be of interest to those who study the history of andragogy in Western European educational institutions that miss an authoritarian period of this science's development.

Regarding Ukrainian discourse, it is important to objectively understand the heritage of past eras as a supplement to the national history of adult education and andragogy. It will allow one to use innovative ideas to develop modern andragogy and integrate them into the system of continuing education.

A comparative study of the history of Ukrainian andragogy in the context of Western European traditions can help one not only evaluate the achievements in this field but also resolve several contradictions in the development of modern andragogy, in particular between:

- the growing need to develop adult education in Ukraine and the uncertain state policy on its institutionalization;
- the active development of organizational forms and types of adult education and the fragmentary level of their scientific and theoretical justification, as well as educational, methodical support and personnel provision;
- the recognized importance of adult education and the insufficient level of educational services, its promotion and the development of mechanisms for involving adults in it;
- the insufficient level of practising teachers' awareness of andragogical achievements and the expediency of their integration into the content of teacher training and the creative use of the historical experience in modern educational practice.

The article aims to identify common and different positive and negative trends in Ukrainian and Western European andragogy throughout the history of this science.

## 2. The Principles of Studying Andragogy's Development in Ukraine

Despite some destructive historical conditions (lack of statehood in Ukraine during the specified period), one can trace the continuing development of andragogy in Ukraine and, thus, formulate the framework principles of its study.

To begin with, *the chronological boundaries of the research* cover the 1890s – 1990s. The lower boundary is associated with the first use of the term "out-of-school education" in pedagogical circles and scientific and journalistic literature. It denoted a set of educational activities designed for the adult population (1894 – a report titled "Out-of-School Education"

presented by Falbork, & Charnoluskiy (1899) at the meeting of the St. Petersburg Literacy Committee; December 1895 – the use of a similar term is recorded in the minutes of the 2nd Congress of Technical and Professional Education in which some prominent educators of that time (Abramov, 1900; Alchevska, 1902; Vakhterov, 1896) participated. After the general term appeared, the first attempts were made to scientifically reflect on the issues of learning and education of the adult population. They were preceded by the activities of educational institutions for adults in the middle of the 19th century, which included Sunday schools, reading rooms, libraries, evening and secondary schools, in the context of the ever-increasing public educational movement in the Ukrainian territories. The upper boundary of the research is related to the 1990s when the collapse of the Soviet Union led to acute social transformations which, in turn, caused radical changes in adult education (its rapid regress with a further gradual revival in the context of modern educational and scientific trends).

The *territorial boundaries of the research* correspond to the administrative division of Ukrainian lands in a certain chronological period. Therefore, the development of theory and practice of adult education is considered within Central, Southern, Eastern Ukraine, that is Dnieper Ukraine. It was part of the Russian Empire and later belonged to the Ukrainian People's Republic. Qualifying as part of the UkrSSR (since 1937 - USSR), it remained part of the USSR until 1991.

*The concept of the research* is to reconstruct the history of andragogy in Ukraine as a holistic phenomenon in the comparative context of democratic tendencies in Western Europe.

The primary idea of the research lies in understanding adult education as a multifaceted and multifunctional socio-cultural, pedagogical and historical phenomenon, whose development has led to andragogy, which is a science of adult education. The genesis of andragogy is considered in close connection with the socio-political and socio-economic development of the country during the period under study. The scale of andragogical research is determined based on the analysis of pedagogical determinants (goals, content, forms and methods of adult learning), their reflection and regulation in legal documents and coverage in scientific and educational literature.

The logic of the research depends on the system-forming processes in adult education at the level of structure, content, organizational forms, methods and their scientific and theoretical justification.

The cross-cutting theme of the research is an assumption about the continuing development of andragogy in Ukraine and the world starting

from the late 19th century to the present. Historical facts and scientific achievements prove that, despite different names, Ukrainian science actively worked on the issues of learning in adulthood and thus contributed to developing andragogy. This process was rather dialectical, dynamic and heterogeneous in content. It helped to realize various goals and objectives and use various organizational forms and methods which either changed, disappeared or were replaced with new ones. The study of these phenomena in historical retrospect is considered an important basis for prognostic conclusions about the development of adult education at the present stage and in the future.

*The methodological basis of the research* involves general provisions of theory and dialectical understanding of the historical-and-pedagogical process; a systematic approach to studying pedagogical phenomena; universal philosophical provisions on the interconnection and interdependence of phenomena in society.

A concrete historical approach has made it possible to analyze the origins and development of andragogy as a theory and practice of adults' education under different economic and cultural-historical conditions. In the context of a problem-related chronological approach, the main attention is focused on a comparative analysis on the development of theoretical principles of andragogy and the practice of adult learning in different historical periods, their evolution, continuity and systematicity. A systemic-synergetic approach has helped to understand adult education as a multifunctional, independent, complex, adaptive, self-developing system with its functions, content, forms and methods. It is characterized by dynamic development and functioning, which proves its uniqueness and originality.

The research is based on the principles of objectivity, historicism, determinism, scientificity and systematicity.

*Research methods* include the following: *universal scientific methods*: historical and logical methods, scientific classification, theoretical analysis and synthesis (used for analytical processing of research sources and justification of its theoretical and methodological principles); *universal historical and pedagogical methods*: historical-structural methods (used to describe adult education as a complex and systemic socio-pedagogical phenomenon), historical-genetic methods (used to determine the factors in the establishment and development of adult education in Ukraine), historical-comparative methods (used to compare theoretical principles of adult education at all stages of its development), historical-typological methods (used to identify the typology of organizational forms of adult education); *special historical methods*, which are used in historical-pedagogical research:

synchronous methods (used to analyze the development of theory and practice of adult education simultaneously in different regions of Ukraine), problem-related chronological methods, periodization (used to justify the periodization of andragogy development), historical modelling (used to analyze a structural model of the adult education system); *partial historical-and-pedagogical methods*: monographic and biographical methods (used to study the evolution of individual views on adult education), paradigmatic methods (used to track changes in the content, forms, methods of adult education within general political, social, pedagogical and educational paradigms).

## 3. The Evolution of the Content and Forms of Training Specialists in Adult Education

At the early beginning of Ukrainian andragogy's development, there already were pan-European trends in the country. The availability of qualified specialists was an indispensable condition for implementing learning programmes for adults. This research proves that the emergence and development of adult education happened due to the personal initiative and enthusiasm of the progressive intelligentsia, given there were no specially trained personnel at the very beginning.

Sunday schools gained some significant experience in this area. They realized didactic and educational tasks and served as methodological centres for adult learning. Historical facts indicate the effective activities of Kharkiv Women's Sunday School and, especially, its founder Alchevska (1902). Here, special attention was paid to the professional skills of adult teachers, apart from various organizational and pedagogical activities. The forms of training and advanced training of adult teachers Alchevska (1902) introduced proved to be effective and promising. They included regular pedagogical meetings, group meetings (similar to modern methodological associations), personal and collective pedagogical diaries, continuing self-study with the help of pedagogical periodicals, working in the library, museums of visual aids.

Zemstvos (county councils) played an important role in training adult teachers. They initiated, organized and financed pedagogical courses, seminaries, congresses and conferences. Besides, they much focused on the readiness of teachers to organize and implement educational work with the general public (acting as educators, librarians, heads of evening schools, disseminators of agricultural knowledge) to promote teacher training. It became a tradition for zemstvos to open special short-term (2-4 weeks) courses for out-of-school teachers. These courses included both general pedagogical and special subjects (the core of out-of-school education; general

and applied principles of organizing public readings, schools for adults, libraries, museums, exhibitions). Such well-known Ukrainian educators as Medinskiy (1930), Rusova (1911) and Siropolko (2001) developed organizational and pedagogical principles of courses for adult teachers and built the content of education, teaching methods and teaching itself.

Taking into account the level of organization and fundamentality of learning content, one can tell the professional training of adult teachers became rather purposeful and systematic.

The forms of adult teachers' training, validated in the late 19th century and the early 20th century, were further developed in the 1920-40s. However, they started to apply general approaches to organizing the content of education in the context of Bolshevik ideology. Such terms as "illiteracy eradicator", "kultarmeets" (a participant in a cultural trip), "cultural worker", "political education worker" were used along with the term "out-of-school education worker". At this time, one could observe a subjective approach to the individual, who was becoming the object of influence of the totalitarian system, to be "curtailed".

Given the national level of the campaign to eradicate illiteracy and increase the political consciousness of the population, professional training of adult teachers acquired official status and was regulated by the state. Clear requirements for employees were determined; remuneration and incentives for their work were introduced; relevant state-owned educational institutions were established (institutes/faculties, out-of-school education departments, communist education academies, political education courses).

At that time, the differences between the professional activities of adult teachers and secondary school teachers were scientifically justified. Accordingly, the requirements for the professional and personal qualities of specialists in adult education were formulated (Chayanov, 1924; Medinskiy, 1930).

Special learning programmes, which included subjects of general, political, psycho-pedagogical and methodological subjects, were developed based on theoretical principles of adult teachers' professionalization and taking into account the requirements of Bolshevik ideology.

They also published ideologically oriented educational and methodical literature (manuals, textbooks, recommendations, instructional and explanatory brochures, guides).

It must be noted that the employees of the adult education system were systematically and purposefully provided with methodological assistance. It covered the following issues: training, retraining and advanced training of personnel; the methods of human resourcing; the methods of organizing the pedagogical process; the methods of monitoring the quality of programmes,

educational and methodical literature; planning and accounting; the study and generalization of such experience and its promotion. The main forms of methodical work were introductory conferences, systematic methodical councils, demonstration lectures, consultations, visits and mutual visits, organization of methodical offices. At the same time, the factor of individual motives, goals and intentions was ignored.

The research finds that both training and advanced training of adult teachers in the 1920s and 1930s became systematic and organized. However, the war years of 1940-45 affected it somewhat negatively. The problem under study again became relevant in the second half of the 20th century, when learning of all provided in different educational institutions for working youth and adults was of nationwide interest. Evening schools acting as the main way of obtaining general secondary education in off-work hours were part of the state system. Adult schools hired teachers trained for secondary schools or vocational and higher education institutions. The analysis of teacher training programs in the 1950s and 1960s proves the lack of individual focus on professional training of adult teachers.

In the late 20th century, the trends in the development of Ukrainian andragogy have finally begun to comply with the global context.

## 4. Comparative Aspects of Ukrainian and Western European Andragogy between the 19th and 20th Centuries

Even though Germany is believed to be the birthplace of andragogy as a science, the beginnings of andragogy in the framework of philosophy, ethics and traditions are already present in East Asia of ancient times and antiquity. The difference primarily lies in the traditions and cultural styles of adult personality development. Also, the initial stages of andragogy's emergence are exclusively associated with practical life and production processes.

The origins of this science are traditionally related to fundamental research on the problem of learning in adulthood (Knowles, 1990; Thorndike, 1935). However, the study of this very issue in the historical-and-pedagogical aspect indicates that andragogical research initiated in Ukrainian pedagogy at the end of the 19th century continues to this day. The analysis of works and practical activities of such prominent educators as Alchevska (1902), Chepiha (2006), Medinskiy (1930), Rusova (1911), Siropolko (2001) and many others reveals some convincing facts of Ukrainians' superiority in the development of theory and practice of adult learning.

Back then, in Western Europe and the USA, andragogy developed rather slowly due to initial scepticism, distrust, and opposition to adult pedagogy. However, it was the time when the main prospects and trends of this science appeared. They include scientific principles of andragogy; andragogy and self-study; lifelong learning; the development of human resources and abilities (Henschke, 2010).

The difference between the Western European and Ukrainian models of andragogy is as follows: Ukrainian andragogy (due to dictatorial regimes) was focused on social practice and Western European sought to develop both internal subjective and external objective aspects of personality. In the 19th century, the German educator Alexander Knapp (1833) introduced the term "andragogy". He believed that morale-building and self-reflection are the primary objectives of adult pedagogy, while professional education and socially significant activities "go second". Knapp (1833) adhered to the principles of Plato, who had a great experience in the socio-philosophical teaching of young adults (p. 241).

Having studied the origins of professional andrology, Henschke (2010) claims that after the First World War, andragogy was the only method for the German people and Germany to revive themselves and their country (p. 1834). The researcher proves that "historical thinking is a fundamental dimension of andragogy, in that historical events are to be analyzed for what can be learned from them so that past failures might not be repeated" (Henschke, 2010, p. 1834). Therefore, the European path of andragogy from the very beginning was human-centred, and not ideologically or methodologically centric, as in Soviet Ukraine.

A simple example of differences in approaches to andragogy in the post-Soviet countries and the democracies with long traditions can be seen in the very definition of the term "andragogy". In the post-Soviet space, the main feature of andragogy is the planning, organization and implementation of adult learning in the educational process. In Western Europe, scholars focus on personality-centred rather than organizational aspects. Conner (2004) believes that andragogy is an area in which the learner's attention is focused more on himself or herself than on the teacher. Taylor & Kroth (2009) believe that the main characteristic of andragogy is collective learning of adults from each other when they are engaged in some complex and creative activities. In Soviet Ukraine, mentoring, instead of partnership principles, is viewed as a peculiar type of professional activities. It is a common system in which experienced workers advise and help novices in the sphere of industrial production. Mentors were trained within a clear

system covering ongoing seminars, schools, people's universities of mentors and self-study.

There are also some common and different features in defining an adult in the history of Ukrainian and foreign andrology.

A common feature is the recognition of learners' social role and independence as key markers of adulthood. Darkenwald & Merriam (1982) indicate that an adult is a person who has taken on the main social role of an employee, spouse or parent and abandoned that of a full-time student. This definition combines both social and psychological roles and differs from that of a child (Darkenwald & Merriam, 1982). As one can see, the psychological factor was taken into account together with the social one. In Ukraine, in the 1980s, the individual factor of adults only began to be considered in andrology and social policy in general.

In Ukraine, between 1917 and 1919, there were attempts to form an authentic opinion about adult education and learning. In the 1920s, however, they launched the deliberate ideologization of education; in the mid-1930s, democratic tendencies were finally suppressed. One could say that from the 1930s to the 1980s, Ukrainian andragogy failed to contribute to global andragogy. Moreover, the totalitarian regime of the USSR, beginning in the late 1940s, affected a large part of Eastern and Western Europe. The Soviet concept of andragogy and its different variants, which one could find in Czechoslovakia, the German Democratic Republic, Bulgaria, and Romania, are indeed specific. The Soviet Union established the concept of adult pedagogy, which is considered part of pedagogy as a comprehensive educational science. It is interesting that in the works of Soviet authors, the pedagogy of higher education is viewed as part of adult pedagogy (Savicevic, 2003). Non-institutional education, as well as self-education outside an ideological pattern, was completely ignored. Andrology was often persecuted as a "bourgeois science", and some attempts were made to refute it by dividing the subject of its study between pedagogy, psychiatry, and medicine.

Ukrainian scholars widely discuss the topics of andragogy, trying to make up for the lost time. Still, they use the concept of andragogy as a synonym for adult learning.

Tymchuk (2014), the researcher of the history of Ukrainian andragogy, offers the following periodization:

**1)** the second part of the 19$^{th}$ century – the early 20$^{th}$ century – the theory and practice of developing adult learning in the context of adult education as a form of socio-educational movement and out-of-school education;

**2)** 1918-1940 – the establishment of the scientific basis for adult learning in the illiteracy elimination system;

**3)** 1950-1980 – the scientific elaboration of andragogical problems within the Soviet concept of adult pedagogy (1950-1960 – the development of theoretical principles of research on working youth and adults; 1970-1980 – the organization of scientific research on the theory and practice of adult learning in the context of continuing education)

**4)** the 1990s – the early 21st century – the development of andragogy as a science (p. 7).

An elementary comparison of these periods with the development of Western European andragogy and the history of Ukraine allows one to draw the following conclusions:

**A.** The Soviet Ukrainian system of andragogy considered the main resource to be a socio-political movement (seen as immanent).

**B.** This system frequently performed functions, uncharacteristic of it (literacy promotion, ideological propaganda).

**C.** Andragogy focused on providing socially useful employment to adults, rather than assisting them in self-determination, self-regulation and self-realization.

**D.** Positive shifts in Ukrainian andragogy have been observed only since the 1990s, after the declaration of independence.

Regarding the differences, since the second half of the 20th century, the Western European concept considered the psychological and self-determining criterion of adulthood as the main one. In Soviet Ukraine, it was the age-related and civil criterion. Knowles (1980) claimed that a person is an adult to the extent that he or she perceives himself or herself as the most responsible for his or her life (Knowles 1980, p. 24). In Soviet Ukraine, on the other hand, adulthood was centred on social and civic duty (everyone over 18 must be an adult).

Although, in the 1970-80s, researchers became more interested in the personality of adult teachers, their scientific and methodological training, personal and professional qualities. Many scientific works (Darinskiy, 2010; Kulyutkin, 1985; Vershlovskiy, 2007) touch these aspects. Their summary somehow outlines adult teachers' job profile diagram as a complex of their personal qualities (benevolence, attention to detail, humanity, respect for students, self-discipline, insistence on high standards, patience), general pedagogical skills (erudition, appreciation of the subject taught, ability to

make it interesting to others, ability to explain its difficult aspects), social and life experience. Specific abilities of adult teachers are defined as follows: the ability to teach learners to apply the acquired knowledge in practice; the ability to help them critically evaluate the previous way of life and cultivate new qualities; the ability to organize work to help adult learners believe in themselves and motivate them towards learning.

Interestingly, an important criterion of teacher professionalism was not only the ability to provide pedagogical guidance to adults but also the willingness to perform managerial functions (general leadership and management of adult schools).

## 5. Conclusions

The realization of adult education objectives required qualified personnel. Indeed, in the late 19th century – the early 20th century, the first forms of training and retraining of adult teachers were introduced in Alchevska Sunday school (Alchevska, 1902). They include pedagogical meetings, group meetings, pedagogical diaries, work in the library. Special training was provided at courses for out-of-school educators organized by zemstvos (county councils). At that time, Ukrainian andragogy was still in the context of European trends and had its own national "face".

The organization of professional training for adult teachers became rather systematic and centralized in the 1920s and 1930s, when the state started to establish appropriate educational institutions, including institutes (faculties, departments) of out-of-school education, academies of communist education, political training courses. However, the innovative guidelines for developing andragogy worldwide were lost due to the repressive nature of early Soviet Ukraine.

In the second half of the 20th century, there were no special programmes for adult teacher training. This is because evening schools for working youth and adults functioned in the structure of general education and, accordingly, were provided with general education teachers.

The system of working with adults, instead of collective cooperation as in Western Europe, widely used mentoring, namely, a form of mentorship of senior and experienced production workers over beginners to promote their professional development and education under the ideological norms. Mentors were trained through holding ongoing seminars, establishing schools and public universities for mentors, engaging in self-study.

In the second half of the 20th century, they established a system of training specialists for non-formal adult education. The All-Union Society

Knowledge implemented various forms of training and advanced training for lecturers (classroom classes, reviewing, holding thematic and instructional seminars, lectures, seminars, meetings, scientific conferences, lecturer days; organizing schools of lecturing skills). This has marked the beginning of Ukraine's integration into the pan-European andragogical context.

This research does not disclose all aspects of the defined problem. Further research should aim to study the development of andragogy in western Ukraine, the role of personalities in the elaboration of andragogical theory and practice, the creation of educational literature for adults in Ukraine, the evolution of the content and forms of adult education, the establishment of the theory and practice of adult education, as well as the history of the andragogue profession.

## Acknowledgement

We, Liudmyla, Tymchuk, Mykhailo, Honchar, Serhii, Medynskyi, Nadiia, Bilyk, Yana, Topolnik, Valentyna, Serheieva confirm our joint authorship of the article "Andragogy in Ukraine and Western Europe: Common and Different Features throughout Its History». We thank the editors for reviewing and printing the article.

## References

Abramov, Ya. V. (1900). *Nashi voskresnye shkoly: ikh proshloe i nastoiashchee* [Our Sunday schools: their past and present]. Tipografiia Merkusheva.

Alchevska, Kh. D. (1902). Khronika voskresnykh shkol [The chronicle of Sunday schools]. *Russkaya shkola* [Russian School], *3*, 251–259. https://elib.nlu.org.ua/object.html?id=6844

Arkhipova, S. P. (2002). *Osnovy andrahohiky* [The fundamentals of andragogy]. Bohdan Khmelnystkyi Cherkasy State University.

Boltivets, S. I. (2010). Osvita dlia tsilozhyttievoi doskonalosti doroslykh suchasnoi Ukrainy [The education for lifelong perfection of adults in modern Ukraine]. *Imidzh suchasnoho pedahoha* [The Image of a Modern Teacher], *10*(109), 3-6.

Chayanov, A. (1924). *Osnovnye idei i metody obshchestvennoi agronomii* [The main ideas and methods of social agronomy]. Novaia derevnia.

Chepiha, Ya. F. (2006). *Vybrani pedahohichni tvory* [Selected pedagogical works]. OVS.

Conner, M. L. (1997). *Andragogy and pedagogy*. Marcia Cornner. http://agelesslearner.com/intros/andragogy.html

Darinskiy A. V. (2010). *Stoletiyu So Dnya Rozhdeniya Vydayushchegosya Uchonogo Akademika* RAO [ Centenniary Of The Birth Outstanding Scientist

Academic RAO]. (2010). *Chelovek i obrazovanie. Akademicheskiy vestnik Instituta obrazovaniya vzroslykh Rossiyskoy akademii obrazovaniya* [Individual and Education. Academic Bulletin of the Institute for Adult Education of the Russian Academy of Education[, *1*(22), 4–6. http://obrazovanie21.narod.ru/Files/2010-1_p004-006.pdf

Darkenwald, G. G., & Merriam, S. B. (1982). *Adult education: foundations of practice*. Harper & Row.

Demchenko, I., Maksymchuk, B., Bilan, V., Maksymchuk, I., & Kalynovska, I. (2021). Training Future Physical Education Teachers for Professional Activities under the Conditions of Inclusive Education. *BRAIN. Broad Research in Artificial Intelligence and Neuroscience, 12*(3), 191-213. https://doi.org/10.18662/brain/12.3/227

Desiatov, T. M. (2014). Tendentsii rozvytku osvity doroslykh: yevropeiskyi dosvid [Trends in adult education development: European experience]. *Osvita doroslykh: teoriya, dosvid, perspektyvy* [Adult Education: Theory, Experience, Prospects], *1*, 182–190. http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/OD_2014_1_26

Falbork, G. A., & Charnoluskiy, V. I. (1899). *Nastolnaia kniga po narodnomu obrazovaniiu* [The handbook on public education]. Tipografiia B. M. Volfa.

Gurevych, R. S., Shakhina, I. Y., & Podzygun, O. A. (2020). Google classroom as an effective tool of smart learning and monitoring of students' knowledge in vocational schools. *Information Technologies and Learning Tools, 79*(5), 59-72. https://doi.org/10.33407/itlt.v79i5.3651

Henschke, J. A. (2010). Beginnings of the history and philosophy of andragogy 1833-2000. In V. X. Wang (Ed.), *Integrating Adult Learning and Technologies for Effective Education: Strategic Approaches* (pp. 1–30). IGI Global.

Hipters, Z. (2014). Pedahohichna diialnist Mykhaila Halushchynskoho v orhanizatsii osvity doroslykh [Mykhailo Halushchynsky's pedagogical activity in the organization of adult education]. *Istoryko-pedahohichnyy almanakh* [The Historical-Pedagogical Almanac], *1*, 49–54. http://nbuv.gov.ua/j-pdf/Ipa_2014_1_8.pdf

Honcharuk, V., Rozhi, I., Dutchak, O., Poplavskiy, M., Rybinska, Yu., & Horbatiuk, N. (2021). Training of Future Geography Teachers to Local Lore and Tourist Work on the Basis of Competence. *Revista Romaneasca pentru Educatie Multidemensionala, 13*(3), 429-447. https://doi.org/10.18662/rrem/13.3/460

Karasievych, S., Maksymchuk, B., Kuzmenko, V., Slyusarenko, N., Romanyshyna, O., Syvokhop, E., Kolomiitseva, O., Romanishyna, L., Marionda, I., Vykhrushch, V., Oliinyk, M., Kovalchuk, A., Halaidiuk, M., & Maksymchuk, I. (2021). Training Future Physical Education Teachers for Physical and Sports Activities: Neuropedagogical Approach. *BRAIN. Broad*

*Research in Artificial Intelligence and Neuroscience*, *12*(4), 543-564. https://doi.org/10.18662/brain/12.4/264

Khatsaiuk, O., Medvid, M., Maksymchuk , B., Kurok , O., Dziuba, P., Tyurina, V., Chervonyi , P., Yevdokimova , O., Levko, M., Demchenko, I., Maliar, N., Maliar, E., & Maksymchuk , I. (2021). Preparing Future Officers for Performing Assigned Tasks through Special Physical Training. *Revista Romaneasca Pentru Educatie Multidimensionala, 13*(2), 457-475. https://doi.org/10.18662/rrem/13.2/431

Knapp, A. (1833). *Platon's Erziehungslehre, als Pädagogik für die Einzelnen und als Staatspädagogik* [Platon's doctrine of education, as pedagogy for the individual and as state pedagogy]. Eßmann.

Knowles, M. S. (1980). *The modern practice of adult education. From pedagogy to andragogy*. Cambridge, the Adult Education Company.

Koliada, N. M. (2004). *Rozvytok nedilnykh shkil v Ukraini (druha polovyna XIX – pochatok XX st.)* [Developing Sunday schools in Ukraine (the second half of the 19th century – the early 20th century). [Unpublished Doctoral Thesis]. Pavlo Tychyna State Pedagogical University, Uman.

Kosholap, A., Maksymchuk, B., Branitska, T., Martynets, L., Boichenko, A., Stoliarenko, O., Matsuk, L., Surovov, O., Stoliarenko, O., & Maksymchuk, I. (2021). Neuropsychological Bases of Self-Improvement of Own Physical Health of Future Teachers in the Course of University Education. *BRAIN. Broad Research in Artificial Intelligence and Neuroscience, 12*(3), 171-190. https://doi.org/10.18662/brain/12.3/226

Kovalenko, S. M. (2005). *Tendentsii rozvytku osvity doroslykh v Anhlii (ostannia chvert XX – pochatok XXI stolittia)* [Trends in adult education development in England (the late 20th century – the early 21st century][Unpublished Doctoral Thesis]. Zhytomyr Ivan Franko State University, Zhytomyr.

Kulyutkin, Yu. N. (1985). *Psikhologiia obucheniia vzoslykh* [Adult Education Psychology]. Prosveshchenie.

Lukianova, L. B. (2012). *Osvita doroslykh: vymohy chasu* [Adult education: the requirements of time]. Proceedings of the International Scientific-Practical Conference on "Relevant Problems of Professional Guidance and Professional Training of the Population". Training Institute of the State Employment Service of Ukraine.

Martirosian, O. I. (2013). *Orhanizatsiino-pedahohichni zasady rozvytku osvity doroslykh v Ukraini (20 – 50-ti rr. XX stolittia)* [Organizational and pedagogical principles of adult education in Ukraine (the 1920-50s)] [Unpublished Doctoral Thesis]. The Institute of Teacher Education and Adult Education of the National Academy of Pedagogical Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv.

Medinskiy, E. N. (1930). Vneshkolnoe obrazovanie [Out-of-school education]. In O. Yu. Shmidt (Ed.), *Bolshaya Sovetskaya Entsiklopediya* [The Great Soviet Encyclopaedia] (pp. 678–691). Sovetskaya entsiklopediya.

Ohiienko, O. I. (2009). *Tendentsii rozvytku osvity doroslykh u skandynavskykh krainakh (druha polovyna KhKh stolittia)* [Trends in adult education development in Scandinavian countries (the second half of the 20th century] [Unpublished Postdoctoral Thesis]. The Institute of Teacher Education and Adult Education of the Academy of Pedagogical Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv.

Ovcharuk, V., Maksymchuk, B., Ovcharuk, V., Khomenko, O., Khomenko, S., Yevtushenko, Y., Rybalko, P., Pustovit, H., Myronenko, N., Syvokhop, Y., Sheian, M., Matviichuk, T., Solovyov, V., & Maksymchuk, I. (2021). Forming Competency in Health Promotion in Technical Specialists Using Physical Education. *Revista Romaneasca Pentru Educatie Multidimensionala, 13*(3), 01-19. https://doi.org/10.18662/rrem/13.3/437

Povidaichyk, O., Pedorenko, V., Popova, A., Turgenieva, A., Rybinska, Yu., & Demchenko, I. (2021). Research Paradigm as a Value Guideline for Professional Training of Future Social Workers. *Revista Romaneasca pentru Educatie Multidemensionala, 13*(3), 530-547. https://doi.org/10.18662/rrem/13.3/465

Protasova, N., & Putsov, V. (2002). Pisliadyplomna pedahohichna osvita: sutnist i suchasne rozuminnia [Graduate teaching training: the essence and today's understanding]. *Neperervna profesiyna osvita: teoriya i praktyka* [Continuing Professional Education: Theory and Practice], *2*, 160-165.

Prots, R., Yakovliv, V., Medynskyi, S., Kharchenko, R., Hryb, T., Klymenchenko, T., Ihnatenko, S., Buzhyna, I., & Maksymchuk, B. (2021). Psychophysical Training of Young People for Homeland Defence Using means of Physical Culture and Sports. *BRAIN. Broad Research in Artificial Intelligence and Neuroscience, 12*(3), 149-171. https://doi.org/10.18662/brain/12.3/225

Rusova, S. (1911). Prosvitnii rukh na Vkraini v 60-kh rokakh [The educational movement in Vkraina in the 60s]. *Svitlo* [The Light], *I*(VI), 34–42. https://kdpu-library.ucoz.ru/index/sofija_rusova_pedagog_derzhavnij_dijach_prosvititel/0-341

Sahun, I. H. (2011). *Rozvytok osvity liudei tretoho viku v Nimechchyni (druha polovyna XX – pochatok XXI stolittia)* [Developing education of the elderly in Germany (the second half of the 20th century – the early 21st century)] [Unpublished Doctoral Thesis]. The Institute of Teacher Education and Adult Education of the Academy of Pedagogical Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv.

Sarancha, I., Maksymchuk, B., Gordiichuk, G., Berbets, T., Berbets, V., Chepurna, L., Golub, V., Chernichenko, L., Behas, L., Roienko, S., Bezliudna, N., Rassskazova, O., & Maksymchuk, I. (2021). Neuroscientific Principles in

Labour Adaptation of People with Musculoskeletal Disorders. *BRAIN. Broad Research in Artificial Intelligence and Neuroscience*, *12*(4), 206-223. https://doi.org/10.18662/brain/12.4/245

Savicevic, D. M. (2003). *Andragogy in European framework: comparative consideration*. Leeds. http://www.leeds.ac.uk/educol/documents/00002830.htm

Shahina, I. Y. (2017). Organization of educational process using electronic educational-methodical complexes for preparation computer technologies specialists. *Information Technologies and Learning Tools, 58*(2), 141-154. https://doi.org/10.33407/itlt.v58i2.1568

Shuhalii, N. Ye. (2015). *Naukovo-pedahohichna spadshchyna Nikolaia Frederika Severina Gruntviha v konteksti rozvytku osvity Danii* [The scientific and pedagogical legacy of Nikolaj Frederik Severin Grundtvig in the context of education development in Denmark] [Unpublished Doctoral Thesis]. Bohdan Khmelnystkyi Cherkasy State University, Cherkasy.

Sihaieva, L. Ye. (2010). *Rozvytok osvity doroslykh v Ukraini (druha polovyna XX st. – pochatok XXI st.)* [Developing adult education in Ukraine (the second half of the 20th century – the early 21st century)]. EKMO.

Siropolko, S. O. (2001). *Istoriia osvity v Ukraini* [The history of education in Ukraine]. Naukova dumka.

Sukhomlynska, O. V. (2003). *Istoryko-pedahohichnyi protses: novi pidkhody do zahalnykh problem* [The historical-pedagogical process: new approaches to general problems]. The Academy of Pedagogical Sciences.

Taylor, B., & Kroth, M. (2009). Andragogy's transition into the future: meta-analysis of andragogy and its search for a measurable instrument. *Journal of Adult Education*, *38*(1), 1–11. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ891073.pdf

Thorndike, E. (1935). *Protses ucheniia u cheloveka* [The process of human learning]. Uchpedgiz.

Tymchuk, L. I. (2014). Main periods of andragogy development in Ukraine (second part of XIX beginning of XXI centuries). *European Science Review*, *7-8*, 61–65. https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/main-periods-of-andragogy-development-in-ukraine-second-part-of-xix-beginning-of-xxi-centuries

Vakhterov, V. P. (1896). *Vneshkolnoe obrazovanie naroda. Selskie biblioteki, knizhnye sklady. Voskresnye shkoly i povtoritelnye klassy* [Out-of-school education of the people. Rural libraries, bookstores. Sunday schools and revision classes]. Izdanie Tovarishchestva I. D. Sytina. http://elib.gnpbu.ru/text/vahterov_vneshkolnoe-obrazovanie-naroda_1896/fs,1/

Vershlovskiy, S. G. (2007). *Neprerywnoe obrazovanie (istoriko-teoreticheskii analiz fenomena)* [Continuing education (historical and theoretical analysis of the

phenomenon)]. St. Petersburg Academy of Postgraduate Pedagogical Education. https://search.rsl.ru/ru/record/01004337905

Vorobets, I. V. (2001). *Osvita doroslykh u Halychyni (1891-1939 rr.)* [Adult education in Galicia (1891-1939)] [Unpublished doctoral thesis]. Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian University, Ivano-Frankivsk.

Vovk, L. P. (1995). *Henezys priorytetnykh tendentsii osvity doroslykh v Ukraini (II-a polovyna XIX - 20-ti roky XX stolittia)* [The origins of priority trends in adult education in Ukraine (the second half of the 19th century – the 20s of the 20th century)] [Unpublished Postdoctoral thesis]. M. P. Drahomanov Ukrainian State Pedagogical University, Kyiv.

Zavhorodnia, T. K. (2014). Retrospektyvnyi analiz teorii i praktyky navchannia doroslykh [A retrospective analysis of theory and practice of adult learning]. *Pedahohichna osvita: teoriya ta praktyk*a [Teacher Education: Theory and Practice], *17*, 37–42. http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/znppo_2014_17_9

Zhurat, Y., Lipshyts, L., Soter, M., Chumak, L., Tarasenko, H., Valchuk-Orkusha, O., & Melnyk, I. (2020). Developing Professional Subjectivity in Future Primary School Teachers in the Context of a Neuropedagogical Approach. *BRAIN. Broad Research in Artificial Intelligence and Neuroscience, 11*(2Sup1), 64-81. https://doi.org/10.18662/brain/11.2Sup1/95

Ziaziun, I. A. (2001). Tekhnolohiztsiia osvity yak istorychna neperervnist [Education technologization as historical continuity]. *Neperervna profesiyna osvita: teoriya i praktyka* [Continuing Professional Education: Theory and Practice], *1*, 73-76. http://lib.iitta.gov.ua/6145/1/%D0%B7%D1%8F%D0%B7%D1%8E%D0%BD4.pdf